Subject: [railML3] rail3:netElement.relation seems useless
Posted by Raphaël Gaudy on Wed, 15 Sep 2021 09:00:22 GMT
View Forum Message <> Reply to Message

Hello

I'm puzzled by the fact that in the infrastructure subschema, netElements contain references to their relations (RTM_NetElement/relation in the schema documentation).

It seems redundant with the definitions used in netRelation: it's always possible to deduce which relations an element is part of, by iterating through all the relations of the infrastructure. But maybe I'm missing something.

In any case, it seems to me that such a redundance could cause more problems than is solves (such as discrepancies due to storing the same piece of information essentially twice). And the rest of the schema does not seem to use this kind of double referencing pattern anyway.

Best regards

PS: by the way thanks for fixing the forum login :)

Subject: Re: [railML3] rail3:netElement.relation seems useless
Posted by christian.rahmig on Thu, 16 Sep 2021 19:36:51 GMT
View Forum Message <> Reply to Message

Dear Raphael,

thank you for your post and welcome to the railML forum. You are absolutely right with noticing that the (optional) reference from the NetElement to the NetRelation is redundant to the (mandatory) reference from the NetRelation to the NetElement. However, fundamental RailTopoModel (RTM) that railML 3.x is based on, contains both references in the model.

Your remark, that this redundancy may cause conflicts, is correct. I suggest the following solution: In order to stay compliant with RTM, we leave the syntax as it is with a (mandatory) reference from the NetRelation to the NetElement and an (optional) reference from the NetElement to the NetRelation. But, as we do not want to have the optional references, we document them as being DEPRECATED and not to be used in order to avoid potential inconsistencies.

This is a proposal and I am eager to hear other opinions from the community...

Thank you very much and best regards
Christian

Subject: Re: [railML3] rail3:netElement.relation seems useless
Posted by christian.rahmig on Thu, 18 Nov 2021 14:54:29 GMT

Dear Raphael,
dear all,

I created an issue in our railML 3 development Git for this topic [1] in order not to forget about it. However, I am still looking forward to receiving more feedback on this proposal from the railML community.

[1] https://development.railml.org/railml/version3/-/issues/481

Thank you very much and best regards
Christian