Subject: stopDescription: Default values for optional attributes
Posted by Philip Wobst on Fri, 07 Apr 2017 10:20:41 GMT
View Forum Message <> Reply to Message

The need to define the common defaults for optional attributes were discussed during timetable developer meeting in Berne (23.03.2017). The main issue is whether or not default values can be anticipated when an attribute is missing.
Please provide feedback regarding the following change to the Wiki here in the forum.

The following is a suggested amendment of the Best Practices for TT:stopDescription

Default values for optional attributes
The following attributes are optional for a stopDecription and no default values have been defined in the XSD. The best practice for an exporting system is to provide these attributes for the stopDescription to avoid misinterpretation by the importing system.
However, should this not be the case then following default values can be anticipated (these were reviewed and mutually agreed on at the last TT developer meeting in Berne on the 23rd of March 2017):
 onOff: both operationalStopOrdered: false stopOnRequest: false guaranteedPass: false commercial: true

NOTE: In railML 3.X these attributes shall either have an agreed default value in the XSD or they should be made mandatory.

Subject: Re: stopDescription: Default values for optional attributes
Posted by   on Tue, 02 May 2017 13:32:07 GMT
View Forum Message <> Reply to Message

Hello all,

I agree with the idea of defining default values for the stopdescription attributes and the new examples in the wiki are already a good starting point.
However, I would not prefer to define 'static' default values for each attribute on its own, because the attributes can't be used independently from each other. Some attributes only make sense, if another attribute has a certain value, some are mutually exclusive. For example, if I want to model a "guaranteed pass" (train must not stop at this station), all attributes except "guaranteed pass" itself are not applicable in this situation, because they specify a "stop" while "guaranteed pass" is for a "pass". So, if we define the default values 'statical' as written below, I would have to write something like

<stopDescription guaranteedPass="true" commercial="false" onOff="none">

which is quite redundant and may lead to confusion in my opinion.

Instead of that, I would define at first which combinations of attributes are allowed and then define the default values for each combination.
I tried to list all meaningful combinations in a table which I uploaded under the name "stopdescription_defaults" to the railml cloud as an input for next telco. As you can see, I choose the same default values as written below, but restricted the use of some attributes, where not applicable. I also included the attribute "stopType" of <ocpTT>, because it is strong connected with the other attributes.

Kind regards
Christian Rößiger

Am 07.04.2017 um 12:20 schrieb Philip Wobst:
> However, should this not be
> the case then following default
> values can be anticipated (these were reviewed and mutually
> agreed on at the last TT developer meeting in Berne on the
> 23rd of March 2017):
> onOff: both operationalStopOrdered: false stopOnRequest:
> false guaranteedPass: false commercial: true
>
> NOTE: In railML 3.X these attributes shall either have an
> agreed default value in the XSD or they should be made
> mandatory.
>

--
iRFP e. K. · Institut für Regional- und Fernverkehrsplanung
Hochschulstr. 45, 01069 Dresden
Tel. +49 351 4706819 · Fax. +49 351 4768190 · www.irfp.de
Registergericht: Amtsgericht Dresden, HRA 9347

Subject: Re: stopDescription: Default values for optional attributes
Posted by   on Mon, 08 May 2017 09:29:02 GMT

Hello,

For better accessibiltiy I put the table, which I referenced in my previous post on my personal wiki page under

 http://wiki.railml.org/index.php?title=User:Christian_R%C3%B6%C3%9Figer#Default_values_of_stop_description_and_their_dep endencies

Best regard
Christian Rößiger

Am 02.05.2017 um 15:32 schrieb Christian Rößiger:
> Hello all,
>
> I agree with the idea of defining default values for the stopdescription
> attributes and the new examples in the wiki are already a good starting
> point.
> However, I would not prefer to define 'static' default values for each
> attribute on its own, because the attributes can't be used independently
> from each other. Some attributes only make sense, if another attribute
> has a certain value, some are mutually exclusive. For example, if I want
> to model a "guaranteed pass" (train must not stop at this station), all
> attributes except "guaranteed pass" itself are not applicable in this
> situation, because they specify a "stop" while "guaranteed pass" is for
> a "pass". So, if we define the default values 'statical' as written
> below, I would have to write something like
>
> <stopDescription guaranteedPass="true" commercial="false" onOff="none">
>
> which is quite redundant and may lead to confusion in my opinion.
>
> Instead of that, I would define at first which combinations of
> attributes are allowed and then define the default values for each
> combination.
> I tried to list all meaningful combinations in a table which I uploaded
> under the name "stopdescription_defaults" to the railml cloud as an
> input for next telco. As you can see, I choose the same default values
> as written below, but restricted the use of some attributes, where not
> applicable. I also included the attribute "stopType" of <ocpTT>, because
> it is strong connected with the other attributes.
>
> Kind regards
> Christian Rößiger
>
>
> Am 07.04.2017 um 12:20 schrieb Philip Wobst:
>>   However, should this not be
>> the case then following default
>> values can be anticipated (these were reviewed and mutually
>> agreed on at the last TT developer meeting in Berne on the
>> 23rd of March 2017):
>> onOff: both operationalStopOrdered: false stopOnRequest:
>> false guaranteedPass: false commercial: true
>>
>> NOTE: In railML 3.X these attributes shall either have an

>> agreed default value in the XSD or they should be made
>> mandatory.
>>
>
>

--
iRFP e. K. · Institut für Regional- und Fernverkehrsplanung
Hochschulstr. 45, 01069 Dresden
Tel. +49 351 4706819 · Fax. +49 351 4768190 · www.irfp.de
Registergericht: Amtsgericht Dresden, HRA 9347