Subject: stopTimes - no reference to the times element
Posted by Philip Wobst on Fri, 03 Jul 2015 06:57:01 GMT

Hello all,

I would like to get some feedback regarding the documentation of the
<stopTimes> element (http://wiki.railml.org/index.php?title=TT:stopTimes).

Existing Semantics:
The stop time as difference between arrival and departure should be:
minimalTime + operationalReserve + additionalReserve

I would like to add the following 'Open Issue'

The description in the semantics sections gives some rules that refer to
the arrival and departure of <times>. However, multiple <times> with
different scope can be provided for one <ocpTT>. In such a case it hast
to be made clear which one was used for the <stopTimes> element - i.e.
which <times> element the rules apply to.

Feedback would be appreciated.

--
Philip Wobst
Consultant
Planning and Dispatching Systems
HaCon Ingenieurgesellschaft mbH
Lister Str. 15
30163 Hannover
Germany/Deutschland

Tel. +49 511 33699-498
Fax. +49 511 33699-99
mailto: philip.wobst@hacon.de
http://www.hacon.de

Registry Court/Amtsgericht: Hannover HRB 1712
Managing Directors/Geschäftsführer:
Michael Frankenberg, Werner Sommerfeld, Peter Talke

Subject: Re: stopTimes - no reference to the times element
Posted by on Mon, 17 Aug 2015 14:16:54 GMT

Dear Philip,

sorry for late answer.

> However, multiple <times> with
> different scope can be provided for one <ocpTT>. In such a case it hast
> to be made clear which one was used for the <stopTimes> element - i.e.
> which <times> element the rules apply to.

The problem in general is comprehensible, I totally agree.

But possibly we are 'hard' on a question of use cases - possibly only a
use case can answer your question.

In the following example (excerpt from a 'real world' example):

```
        <ocpTT sequence=... ocpRef=... ocpType='stop'>
          <times scope='scheduled' arrival='23:06' departure='23:11'/>
          <times scope='published' departure='23:07'/>
          <sectionTT ....>
            <runTimes minimalTime='PT37.14S'
operationalReserve='PT1.14S'/>
          </sectionTT>
          <stopDescription commercial='true' stopOnRequest='false'>
            <stopTimes minimalTime='PT30S'/>
          </stopDescription>
        </ocpTT>
```

There are many connections which can only be solved semantically:
  - There is only a 'published' departure time - no arrival. Obviously,
the 'scheduled' arrival is not superseded by a 'published' arrival but
the 'scheduled' departure _is_ superseded by a 'published' one.
  - The 'run times' apply to the 'scheduled' time (if they apply to
anything at all).
  - The 'stop description' is general - it does not need to apply
specially to scheduled or published. Both 'stop times' are larger than
the minimum.

You see, possibly we cannot define a fixed linkage between stop times
and arrival/departure times outside use cases.

However, if you want to do it in general anyway, I would have no
objections. My suggestion: Introduce an attribute
"scope='scheduled'/'published'/..." for <stopDescription>, too, and
allow multiple <stopDescription>s.
But, I would then like to be consequent and also define dependencies
between different <times> as for instance
  - "published overrides scheduled",
  - "if no published is given, published is same as scheduled'

a. s. o.

With best regards,
Dirk Bräuer.

Subject: Re: stopTimes - no reference to the times element
Posted by Vasco Paul Kolmorgen on Thu, 02 Jun 2016 12:55:58 GMT
View Forum Message <> Reply to Message

This issue was discussed in the railML's Timetable developer meeting in Berlin on June 2nd, 2016.

Conclusion: The participating developers declared, that the stopTimes are used with the scope of scheduled times currently. A extension to the Wiki entry for TT:stopTimes documentation for this usage shall be added.

railML partners who are using stopTimes with a different scope are asked to post their opinion here.

Regards,
--
Vasco Paul Kolmorgen
railML.org Coordinator
Dresden; Germany   www.railml.org