

Hello Dirk and others,

The following aspect was quite overseen, sorry for that.

I changed the follow-up to railML.misc because of the more general topic.

Dirk Bräuer <dirk.braeuer@irfp.de> writes:

> <speedChange id="sc3"...>

>

> Can we have the 'id' of a speed change as an optional attribute? Since
> we have many, many speed changes and seldom the need to refer to them
> I do (optionally) want to save some space and effort.

* The "id" attribute provides good facilities to fetch single elements (with its attributes and sub-elements) from an XML file irrespective of an existing reference in the XML file.

* There are other often-used XML standards that use the same mechanism:

e.g. GML (Geographic Markup Language)

```
<attribute name="id" type="ID">
  <annotation>
    <documentation>The attribute gml:id supports provision of a handle
    for the XML element representing a GML Object. Its use is
    mandatory for all GML objects. It is of XML type ID, so is
    constrained to be unique in the XML document within which it
    occurs.</documentation>
  </annotation>
</attribute>
```

```
<complexType name="AbstractGMLType" abstract="true">
  <sequence>
    <group ref="gml:StandardObjectProperties"/>
  </sequence>
  <attribute ref="gml:id" use="required"/>
</complexType>
```

This attribute is required for all GML objects irrespective any reference.

A huge amount of XML Schemas in the Geographic field of application

base on the above mentioned XML Schema.

* It is already a very smart implementation for identification.

The following example shows up a typical alternative from the banking sector:

```
<act:id type="guid">aa671349a0befafcfff1773e42eb8a49</act:id>
```

* There are algorithms for different programming languages for the ID-generation in general.

e.g. generate-id() in XPath (staying at the XML-world) ;-)

* The `_required_` attribute may only be changed into "optional" for the next major release.

I hope it clarifies the issue a bit.

Kind regards...
Susanne

Crosspost & Followup-To: railML.misc

--

Susanne Wunsch
Schema Coordinator: railML.common
