

---

Subject: TT:007 - stop on request for passenger trains only?

Posted by on Fri, 20 Mar 2020 11:05:08 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

---

Dear community,

in "our guidelines on semantic constraints" it is written "please discuss it in the forum". Therefore, I want to note that I have an objection concerning Proposed Semantic Constraint "TT:007" at [1]:

> A stop on request is a traffic stop. A train will only stop at a stop on request stop when stopping is requested by passengers, regardless if its passengers aboard the train or waiting at the station.

This proposed statement assumes that a stop on request must be linked with passengers and therefore, cannot happen at non-passenger trains. I think this is too much restrictive. I would not limit stops on request to passengers only.

I can easily imagine a local freight train which is scheduled to pick up / set down wagons at an immediate stations. Not at each station on each operating day there will be an actual demand. So why should the train stop at each station on each operating day?

In my opinion, the term "stop on request" tells the reader that a scheduled stop can be omitted without a timetable change. Vice versa, if a scheduled stop which is not "on request" shall be omitted, there would be a new/changed timetable necessary.

The main difference between passenger and freight stops on request is: A stop on request for passenger trains is typically very short; the train path after that stop is varied not very much (possibly only within the amount of run time supplements), so the train is still more or less "in time". A stop on request of a freight train can hardly be short so in case it is omitted, the train will significantly fall out of its timetable.

So the question for us in railML is: Do we want to force freight trains to get a new timetable in case of omitted stops because otherwise, they would fall significantly (too much for the railML community) out of schedule?

In my opinion: No. Freight trains already run very often very much out of schedule. We should accept that as a matter of fact and not interfere into practice here. So if the community follows my recommendation, I would suggest that the above mentioned statement is alter to:

> A stop on request is a traffic stop. A train will only stop at a stop on request stop when stopping is requested by traffic. The stop can be omitted without a further notice and without a change of timetable. In case of passenger trains, this is regardless of passengers aboard the train or waiting at the station.

Best regards,  
Dirk.

[1] <https://wiki2.railml.org/index.php?title=TT:stopDescription>

---