Subject: Re: Required 'id' attributes (was: More detailed 'speed change' definitions)
Posted by   on Thu, 08 Nov 2012 19:52:12 GMT
View Forum Message <> Reply to Message

Dear Susanne,

thank you for the reply.

Some of the aspects on 'id's in RailML

> * There are other often-used XML standards that use the same mechanism:

Yes, of course, all strict-relational data models do so.
(Strict-relational data models need to have Id's.)

In RailML, we also have some hierarchy (so RailML is not
strict-relational) and, more important, we do not know about the data
model of the reading/writing software. So I would say it is bad to force
it to strict-relational data models.

Additionally, we do not have 'id's at each <elements>, so the selection of
elements with id (out of all elements) is a rather arbitrary one. If your
arguments would be accepted: Wouldn't we need to provide 'id's at all
<elements>, would we?

So to come out of this current "arbitrariness" I thought about the rule
"no 'id' without a 'ref' to it". So: If we need a reference, we have to
provide both 'id' and 'ref'.

That would lead us to a rather logic structure: Hierarchy (<elements>)
combined with non-hierarchic references with 'id's.

The question on the meaning of 'id's in RailML (as a primary key for
relational data models) is a more general one - not specially on speed
changes, so I will end this arguing here and open a new topic at "misc".

Best regards,
Dirk.