Posted by   on Tue, 21 Jul 2015 14:27:32 GMT
View Forum Message <> Reply to Message

Hello everyone,

the wiki description of the attribute operationalStopOrdered of the
element stopDescription says "This indicates that the stop is requested
by the infrastructure manager.". In my opinion the name of the attribute
indicates an inverse meaning:
- operationalStopOrdered = True: The stop is ordered by the operational
undertaking, e.g. for staff exchange
- operationalStopOrdered = False: The stop is arranged in responsibility
of the infrastructur manager.
The examples on the wiki page are already labeled in this way, so I
assume that the description is a misunderstanding. I suggest to change
the description to "This indicates that the operational stop is
requested by the operational undertaking / TOC." optionally with the
explanation "e.g. for staff exchange" to clarify its usage.

Best regards
Christian Rößiger
--
iRFP e. K. · Institut für Regional- und Fernverkehrsplanung
Hochschulstr. 45, 01069 Dresden
Tel. +49 351 4706819 · Fax. +49 351 4768190 · www.irfp.de
Registergericht: Amtsgericht Dresden, HRA 9347

Subject: Re: Unclear wiki description of attribute operationalStopOrdered
Posted by Philip Wobst on Fri, 24 Jul 2015 11:12:05 GMT
View Forum Message <> Reply to Message

Hello all,

I agree that the description and the example should be the same.
However, the term operational is used in different elements and I do not
see that it is always used to specify an attribute that is associated
with the train operator instead of the infrastructure manager.

The attribute was introduce in 2.2 in TRAC ticket #140
(https://trac.railml.org/ticket/140) and the description there says it
is used for a 'bestellter Betriebshalt' which translates to 'ordered
operational stop'. The corresponding change to the xsd shows the
following annotation: 'the stop is requested by the infrastructure manager'
I would interpret this to mean 'true = ordered by IM' and thus without a
change to the XSD an update of the wiki example would be necessary to
show a correct example.

Best regards,

Philip Wobst

--
Philip Wobst
Consultant
Planning and Dispatching Systems
HaCon Ingenieurgesellschaft mbH
Lister Str. 15
30163 Hannover
Germany/Deutschland

Tel. +49 511 33699-498
Fax. +49 511 33699-99
mailto: philip.wobst@hacon.de
http://www.hacon.de

Registry Court/Amtsgericht: Hannover HRB 1712
Managing Directors/Geschäftsführer:
Michael Frankenberg, Werner Sommerfeld, Peter Talke

Subject: Re: Unclear wiki description of attribute operationalStopOrdered
Posted by   on Fri, 24 Jul 2015 14:57:52 GMT
View Forum Message <> Reply to Message

Hi all,

Philip and I agreed to change the remark in Wiki to
"operationalStopOrdered: This indicates that the stop is requested by
the operator".

For the sake of dokumentation: Philip did ask me via E-Mail whether I
can remember an earlier discussion on that theme and I did answer:

The reason for the dilemma is from my opinion that the attribute
"operationalStopOrdered" was renamed from "requestedByInfrastructure".
Then, the remark reads right:
 "requestedByInfrastructure: This indicates that the stop is requested
by the infrastructure manager."

but not the German translation "bestellter Betriebshalt".

Therefore, the attribute was renamed into "operationalStopOrdered".
Since then, the German translation ("bestellter Betriebshalt") fits but
no longer the English one...

Conclusion: The English remark should be change e. g. into "This indicates that the stop is requested by the operator".

The examples should not be changed.

Best regards,
Dirk Bräuer.

Philip frug mich per E-Mail:

> Kannst du dich erinnern, wie die ursprüngliche Diskussion bezüglich dieser Änderung mal war?

und ich antwortete:

Ursache ist m. E., dass das Attribut "operationalStopOrdered" ursprünglich "requestedByInfrastructure" hieß: Dafür stimmt nämlich die Anmerkung:

requestedByInfrastructure: This indicates that the stop is requested by the infrastructure manager.

aber nicht die deutsche Beschreibung "bestellter Betriebshalt".

Daher wurde das Attribut später in "operationalStopOrdered" umbenannt: Seitdem stimmt die deutsche Beschreibung ("bestellter Betriebshalt"), aber die englische Anmerkung nicht mehr...

Fazit: Nur die englische Anmerkung sollte z. B. in "This indicates that the stop is requested by the operator." geändert werden.

Die Beispiele bitte nicht ändern!

Viele Grüße,
Dirk.