
Subject: Re: Haltetafel / stop post
Posted by on Mon, 12 Nov 2012 11:34:19 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

Dear Christian,

I guess there was a misunderstanding of my sentence

>> Anyway, it tells us once more that in RailML there should be a
>> possibility to describe "H" with min/max (as in Germany) _and_
>> "interpolating" (as in Switzerland).

What I meant is: Give the programmes a hint how to interpret the stop posts.

What I did not mean: Fully describe the operational rules which are valid for stop posts.

In general, we always have to ask us: "Is it infrastructure property or operational rule?" May be in future when everything else is settled and we don't know what to do anymore, we create a RailML scheme for operational rules. But until then, we should keep them out of <infrastructure> and <timetable> and <rollingStock>.

Of course there is a "gray zone" where we cannot be sure whether it is infrastructure property or operational rule. The following questions should help us:

- What we can touch and read (outside our offices) should normally be infrastructure.
- If we cannot touch it: Is the origin an objective physical property or an arbitrary man-made rule?
- If we cannot touch it: Does a driver or signaller has to know it or can he deduce it from something else?

If he has to know it --> rather an operational rule.
If he can deduce or read it --> rather infrastructure.

A speed change we cannot touch, but at least the basic permitted speeds are of physical nature. The drivers do not need to know all the (virtual) speed changes from their minds (normally they can read them from a timetable), so this is infrastructure. But if he cannot read it but has to know or deduce it (e. g. end of speed restriction of some main signals in Germany), it is rather not a speed change, even not a virtual one.

How to interpret stop posts (interpolating, cascaded) the driver normally has to know. If there are any additional signs at the stop post one could read, these would be infrastructure ("30 m", "Passenger trains only" or

such). The rule alone ("please stop interpolated between two signs") is not infrastructure.

Additionally, the rules are normally the same in a greater area, so they are "factored out" and expressed indirectly by something like `<trackElements><operationModeChange>`. To repeat the rule at each stop post would be redundant.

So: Please provide attributes for the additional signs at stop posts but nothing more. I herewith withdraw my wish for "min", "max" as long as these words are not actually written at the stop posts.

Best regards,
Dirk.
